Knowledge into Action:
Stakeholders gather to discuss how information gathered can be used to inform real change on the ground in the fight against worst forms of child labor and forced adult labor.

VERITÉ

May 28, 2009
Accra, Ghana

Experts from over 35 institutions gathered in Accra Ghana on May 18 - 19, 2009 to discuss the next steps in the fight against worst forms of child labor and forced adult labor at a meeting titled “Knowledge into Action: Balancing the Need to Know with the Need for Change.” As the title suggests, diverse stakeholders took part in robust discussion about the role data plays in improving conditions on the ground.

Through expert presentations and small working groups, participants took an in-depth look at research that has already been done, and made recommendations on what can be done in the future to improve and coordinate data collection, reporting, and remediation.

This meeting report contains a list of participating institutions, the meeting agenda, and speaker bios as well as the expert statement that includes consensus points reached in the working groups. To see PowerPoints from the experts’ presentations, please see: www.verite.org.
PARTICIPATING INSTITUTIONS

African Cocoa Coalition
Afrique Secours et Assistance
Cadbury
Challenging Heights
Cocoa Research Institute of Ghana
CODESULT
FAFO
Fair Wages
FEMAD
Free the Slaves
Frontier Analysis Consulting Associates
FURDEV
Ghana Cocobod
Ghana Agricultural Workers Union
Ghana Federation of Labor
Global Issues Group
Government of Ghana
Government of Côte d’Ivoire
Harvard University
Hershey’s
International Cocoa Initiative
International Cocoa Verification Board
International Initiative to End Child Labor
Khulisa Management Services
National Confectioners Association
Payson Center, Tulane University
Promag Network
Rural Environmental Care Association
SOS Ghana
University of Ghana
US Department of Labor
US Department of State
US Embassy in Ghana
Verité
Winrock
DAY 1

8:55 Dr. Stephen Ayidiya calls meeting to order/Prayer, introduces Mil Niepold

9:00 Mil Niepold opens meeting and welcomes the Minister Kwao

9:05 Welcome by Minister Stephen Kwao, Ministry of Employment and Social Welfare, Republic of Ghana

9:30 Mil Niepold welcomes and introduces Malick Adam Tohe, Executive Secretary, Child Labor Monitoring System, Office of the Prime Minister of Côte d’Ivoire

9:35 Malick Adam Tohe, Special Advisor to Prime Minister, Executive Secretary SSTE presents Côte d’Ivoire’s progress on implementing the Harkin-Engel Protocol

10:00 Reading of Statement of prepared by the offices of Senator Harkin and Representative Engel

10:20 Jeff Morgan, Mars, Inc. on behalf of GIG Review of Where We Are Now, Industry’s Continued Commitment, and Industry’s Vision for the Future

11:05 Ghana Panel (followed by Q+A with Participants) Ghana’s Views and the way forward for Ghana and update regarding the Child Labor Monitoring System (CLMS) and plans for the future of data collection and community based approaches to child labor monitoring, prevention of WFCL and FAL and early warning systems. Discussion will also include an update of work done to date following the verifier’s reports. Panelists: Dr. Philip Amoo, Professor N. N. Nsowah-Nuamah, Rita Owusu-Amankwah

“We are working towards a time when farmers and their families can live in vibrant cocoa communities” - Jeff Morgan, Mars

“We cannot say that we are eliminating child labor until we have a holistic approach to poverty alleviation and for this we need the long-term support of all stakeholders.” Honorable Minister Kwao
Côte d’Ivoire Panel (followed by Q+A with Participants) Côte d’Ivoire’s views on the way forward and future strategies based on lessons learned from various reports and outline of CDI’s reactions to the verification report and what steps have been taken (and will be taken) in the future to implement the verifiers’ recommendations Panelists: Malick Tohe, Serge N’Cho, Anne Marie Konan-Payne, Bi Djéhiffé Bollou, Monnet Innocent Abi

Kevin Bales, (President, Free the Slaves) Recommendations for A Future Road Map: Balancing the Need for Information with the Need for Progress. What are the key indicators for success?

International Cocoa Initiative: Peter McAllister, (Executive Director, ICI) introduces Patience Dapaah and Robale Kagohi

Patience Dapaah and Robale Kagohi present: A practitioner’s view of the role data plays in ICI’s work and what is needed from their perspective in terms of data collection and coordination of remediation to increase the impact of remediation programs

Dr. Bill Bertrand, (Co-founder and former Director, Payson Center for International Development and Technology Transfer): Highlights of what Tulane University has observed to date

Mil Niepold moderates Question and Answer Session with Speakers

We must prioritize remediation activities that help children over verification.

Dr. Kevin Bales, Free the Slaves

Data is crucial to effective planning, implementation and evaluation of activities to eliminate WFCL

Patience Dapaah, International Cocoa Initiative
AGENDA

DAY 2
9:00  Mil Niepold: Opens and explains format and ground rules for the day
9:15  Context Setting: Question of the Day: Mil Niepold
9:30  PLENARY DISCUSSION: Future of Data Collection: What works, what doesn’t and when is enough data enough?
10:30 BREAK
11:00 SMALL GROUPS: Participants break into pre-selected groups (Groups will be given questions that come out of Day One. Each group will have a facilitator).

Group One: Coordination of Remediation for Increased Impact
Group Two: Trafficking and Forced Adult Labor
Group Three: Collection, Reporting and Uses of Quality Data: What’s Next?
Noon: Lunch
1:00 Working Groups Continue
2:30 Break
3:00 Groups Report in Plenary
4:00 Mil Niepold: Discussion in Plenary of Next Steps (who, what, where, when, how?)
5:00 Meeting Concludes

“The SSTE is now engaged in the remediation phase which is the most important phase because it must contribute to socioeconomic development in cocoa producing areas.”
-Malick Tohe, SSTE
**Speaker Bios**

**Monnet Innocent Abi**  
Monnet Innocent Abi is an Expert Consultant Statistician for Côte d’Ivoire.

**Dr. Philip Amoo**  
Dr. Amoo is the Occupational Safety and Health Specialist, CCLM, Ghana.

**Dr. Kevin Bales**  
Kevin Bales is President of Free the Slaves, the US sister organization of Anti-Slavery International (the world’s oldest human rights organization), and Professor of Sociology at Roehampton University in London. He also serves on the Board of Directors of the International Cocoa Initiative. His book *Disposable People: New Slavery in the Global Economy*, published in 1999, was nominated for the Pulitzer Prize, and has now been published in ten other languages. He is working with the chocolate industry to remove child and slave labor from the product chain, and writing on contemporary slavery. His book *Ending Slavery*, a roadmap for the global eradication of slavery, was published in September 2007. He is currently editing a collection of modern slave narratives, and co-writing a book on slavery in the United States today with Ron Soodalter. He gained his Ph.D. at the London School of Economics.

**Dr. Bill Bertrand**  
Dr. Bertrand is the Founder and former Executive Director of the Payson Center at Tulane University. He serves on the Infectious Disease Advisory Board of the National Institutes of Health (NIH) and is a full professor at Tulane University.

**Bi Djéhiffé Bollou**  
Bi Djéhiffé Bollou is the General Director of Work, Executive Secretary, SSTÉ, Côte d’Ivoire.

**Patience Dapaah**  
Ms. Dapaah is currently the field partner of the International Cocoa Initiative in Ghana. She has expertise in biochemistry and community health planning, as well as over 16 years of experience in communication and broadcasting. She formerly worked as a communications officer with the Ministry of Manpower, Youth and Employment (now the Ministry of Employment and Social Welfare). To all of her work, she brings sensitivity to issues of gender development.

**Robale Kagohi**  
Mr. Kagohi is currently the International Cocoa Initiative’s field partner in Côte d’Ivoire. He previously held the position of Director of Independent Literacy service of the Ministry of National Education. His area of expertise is informal education.
Anne Marie Konan-Payne
Mme Anne Marie Konan-Payne is the General Director, CICG, Communications Director, SSTE, Côte d’Ivoire.

Honorable Minister Stephen Kwao
The Honorable Minister Kwao is Ghana’s Minister of Employment and Social Welfare. Hon. Minister Kwao has been a Member of Ghana’s Parliament since 2001 on the ticket of the National Democratic Congress (NDC) for the Upper Manya Krobo Constituency. Until his appointment as Minister, he was a Deputy Director at the Ghana Education Service. Hon. Stephen Amoanor Kwao was sworn in as a Minister of Employment and Social Welfare in February, 2009 by H.E. Professor J.E.A. Mills, President of the Republic of Ghana.

Jeff Morgan
Jeff Morgan is the Director of Global Programs for Mars, Incorporated, based at their global headquarters in McLean, Virginia, near Washington, DC. He joined Mars, Incorporated in 1979 where he has focused his attention on all aspects of the value chain for cocoa and chocolate. In that time he has worked on projects in nearly every major cocoa-growing region. Since 2005 Jeff has primarily worked to address questions related to Child and Adult labor practices in the cocoa sectors of Côte d’Ivoire and Ghana, representing not only the interests of Mars, Incorporated – but also the interests of the North American and European cocoa industry coalition – the Global Issues Group (GIG). Within this effort, Jeff has worked in partnership with key stakeholders in Ghana and Côte d’Ivoire – being actively engaged on the ground and spending significant amounts of time in the West African Cocoa growing regions over the past 5 years. In addition to his effort on labor practices, Jeff is also working to implement a novel public / private partnership undertaken by Mars with a select group of Civil Society partners. The program, known as iMPACT (The Mars Partnership for African Cocoa Communities of Tomorrow) is focused on bringing needed services to cocoa growing communities in Ghana and Côte d’Ivoire, using a community empowerment model of entry, assessment and delivery.

Serge Pacôme N’cho
Serge Pacôme N’cho is the Technical Director, SSTE, Côte d’Ivoire. He received a Diplôme d’Agronomie Générale and Diplôme d’Agronomie Approfondie (D.A.A), from the Ecole Supérieure d’Agronomie de l’INPHB de Yamoussoukro.
Professor Nicholas N. N. Nsowah-Nuamah
Professor N. N. N. Nsowah-Nuamah is a Professor of Statistics at the Institute of Statistical Social and Economic Research, University of Ghana and the Deputy Government Statistician at Ghana Statistical Service. He is a member/fellow of American Statistical Society, Royal Statistical Society and the International Statistical Institute. He is the chairman of a number of National Technical Committees.

Rita Owusu-Amankwah
Mrs. Rita Owusu-Amankwah is a development practitioner with expertise in child protection and development; institutional development, rural development and project management. She has experience working with multiple national and international stakeholders at the same time and ability to pull people together to achieve great results. She was the Country Programme Coordinator for International Labour Organisation’s (ILO) West Africa Cocoa/Commercial Agriculture Project WACAP funded by USDOL. She started the Ghana National Program for the Elimination of Worst Forms of Child Labor (NPECLC) in 2006 as the National Program Manager. As NPM she has successfully coordinated two surveys in the cocoa production sector of Ghana which led to the development and presentation of Ghana’s Cocoa certification report in 2008. This report has been assessed successfully by International Verification Team commissioned by the International Cocoa Verification Board. She is also currently coordinating activities in 47 cocoa districts in Ghana as well as community based child labor monitoring. She was also acting Programme Manager for Training and Research department at CEDEP and Society Development Officer responsible for Ashanti Region in Ghana for Kuapa Kokoo Ltd. farmer cooperative organization. She holds a BA in Sociology and Economics; M.A. in Industrial Management; and Post Graduate Diploma in Organizational Development.

Malick Tohe
Malick Tohe is the Special Advisor to the Prime Minister, Executive Secretary SSTE, Côte d’Ivoire.
WORKING GROUP RECOMMENDATIONS

26 May 2009

The Expert Panel, with nearly 100 participants, met in Accra from 18-20th May 2009 under the title of “Knowledge into Action – Balancing the Need to Know with the Need for Change” in the presence of both the Minister and the Deputy Minister of Employment and Social Welfare of the Government of the Republic of Ghana and of Mr. Malick Tohe, Executive Secretary of the Child Labour Task Force of the Government of Côte d’Ivoire. The Panel recognized that moving forward; efforts on WFCL must address the concerns of a broad group of stakeholders, while focusing on the needs of children. To that end the detailed discussions reflected a broad range of stakeholder perspectives (Governments, farmers, children, civil society, industry and consumers) and centered on three themes related to the lives/work of children and adults in the cocoa sector. Themes and major outcomes / agreements are noted below:

1. Collection, Reporting and Uses of Quality Data
   - Government representatives agreed to continue their efforts at “weighting” previous survey data per suggestions in the verifier report. The panel agreed that when this action is appropriately completed, the surveys of both countries will represent a sector wide analysis of the cocoa producing areas of each country related to the incidence of WFCL.
   - It was further agreed that significant value would be obtained by carrying out a meta-analysis of all recent surveys performed within the countries that address labor issues / practices.
   - The group agreed that for improved consistency of future work a “Joint Working Group,” including technical and policy representatives from each country, along with invited experts, would convene.
   - Initial items to be considered by this working group would be:
     - The comparison and agreement regarding indicators, benchmarks and methods for future data collection efforts.
     - The group would also evaluate the results of the meta-analysis of the collected data in each country to determine a recommendation on ongoing survey frequency. A broad consensus for the next sector wide survey to take place in 3 years will be further considered as part of this effort.
     - Using the data, create child labor “data-gathering modules” for the possible addition to national surveys as an efficient method of sector wide data collection in the future.
   - The Community-based Child Labor Monitoring programs planned in each country will be pursued initially with pilot activities, focusing efforts on assuring that data collection and reporting methods are credible.
   - It was proposed that additional support be mobilized from multiple stakeholders to ensure that there is an appropriate facility for the rehabilitation of victims of trafficking or forced labor.
WORKING GROUP RECOMMENDATIONS

2. Improved Coordination of Remediation Efforts for Increased Impact

It was agreed by all that the priority of future efforts in the cocoa sectors must be remediation.

- It was agreed that Governments would take the lead to further enhance the coordination efforts currently underway in each country. It was confirmed that Governments must lead this activity.
- Each government will determine additional methods to engage those groups working in the country to share data and encourage a more strategic approach to the design and performance of remediation activities.
- It was agreed that a significant element of enhanced coordination would be the opportunity to deliver improved communication of the activities of the large program of work that is currently underway.
- Industry, Donor and NGO partners are called upon to actively engage with the Government led coordination mechanisms already in place.
- It was also agreed that any incidents of trafficking or forced labor, discovered as a result of community monitoring would be immediately acted upon.
- It was proposed that resources be mobilized to support the existence of an appropriate rapid reaction response capability in each country, to follow up suspected cases of trafficking or forced labor and where necessary to act to rescue the victim/s.
3. Addressing Trafficking and Forced Adult Labor:

- It was agreed that the recent, household based surveys are not an appropriate methodology for quantifying the extent of Trafficking or Forced Adult Labor in the cocoa sector in either country.
- Governments stated that they would welcome additional targeted research in each country, using appropriate methodologies, to gain greater insight on the extent and root causes of trafficking and forced adult labor.
- It was also noted that current efforts in remediation and planned community based child labor monitoring systems (CCLMS), can serve both as a deterrent to both trafficking and forced labor as well as building a comprehensive dataset of practices.
- It was also agreed that any incidents of trafficking or forced labor, discovered as a result of community monitoring would be immediately acted upon.
- It was proposed that resources be mobilized to support the existence of an appropriate rapid reaction response capability in each country, to follow up suspected cases of trafficking or forced labor and where necessary to act to rescue the victim/s.
- It was proposed that additional support be mobilized from multiple stakeholders to ensure that there is an appropriate facility for the rehabilitation of victims of trafficking or forced labor.

4. Key Contacts

**Government of Côte d’Ivoire**
- Hon. Hubert Oulaye, Minister of Civil Service and Employment, First Vice President, SSTE
- Malick Tohe, Executive Secretary of the Child Labour Task Force
  Email: m.tohe@cacao.gouv.ci
- Serge N’Cho, Technical Director, SSTE
  Email: sergepacomencho@yahoo.fr

**Government of Ghana**
- Hon. Antwi-Boasiako Sekyere, Deputy Minister of Employment and Social Welfare
- Rita Owusu-Amankwah, National Director, NPECLC
  Email: rdamoah@yahoo.com

**Industry / Global Issues Group**
- Jeff Morgan, Mars, Inc.
  Email: jeff.morgan@effem.com
- Jonathan Atwood, Global Issues Group
  Email: jonathan@atwoodcomms.com

**Convener**
- Mil Niepold, Senior Policy Advisor, Verité
  Email: mil.niepold@verizon.net
Verité is an independent, non-profit socially responsible auditing, training, capability building and research organization established in 1995. Our mission is to ensure that people worldwide work under safe, fair and legal working conditions. We achieve this by partnering with corporations, NGOs, governments, and international institutions. Our experience spans over 70 countries and territories.

For more information of Côte d’Ivoire’s efforts to eliminate worst forms of child labor, please see: [http://www.cacao.gouv.ci/](http://www.cacao.gouv.ci/)

For more information on Ghana’s efforts to eliminate worst forms of child labor, please see: [http://www.childprotection.gov.gh/](http://www.childprotection.gov.gh/)
Co-hosted by the governments of Ghana and Côte d’Ivoire

SPONSORS

ADM Cocoa
Association of the Chocolate, Biscuit and Confectionary Industries of the EU (CAOBISCO)
Barry Callebaut
Cadbury
Cargill
Confectionery Manufacturers of Australasia (CMA)
Confectionery Manufacturers of Canada (CMAC)
European Cocoa Association (ECA)
Federation of Cocoa Commerce (FCC)
Ferrero
Kraft Foods
Mars Incorporated
National Confectioners Association of the US (NCA)
Nestle
The Hershey Company
World Cocoa Foundation (WCF)

Convened by Verité