Cornell University
ILR School

ILRReview

Volume 65 | Number 4 Article 12

11-26-2012

Disintegrating Democracy at Work: Labor Unions and the Future of Good Jobs in the Service Economy by Virginia Doellgast

Tashlin Lakhani

Follow this and additional works at: http://digitalcommons.ilr.cornell.edu/ilrreview

Disintegrating Democracy at Work: Labor Unions and the Future of Good Jobs in the Service Economy by Virginia Doellgast

Keywords
book review

This book review is available in ILRReview: http://digitalcommons.ilr.cornell.edu/ilrreview/vol65/iss4/12

and Reese certainly does not gloss over the tensions among groups, especially over forming strategy. She discusses the battles among the various unions (SEIU, Communication Workers of America, and AFSCME) as well as with ACORN over who might best represent child care workers. She describes the difficult decision to promote "deserving" immigrants, such as the Hmong who had helped the United States in Vietnam, over other groups when organizing to keep legal immigrants receiving public benefits—despite representing far more immigrants who were seen as less deserving (e.g., Mexican immigrants). Reese also pays considerable attention to ways in which political leaders respond and/or lead, focusing on state politicians in Wisconsin and county-level ones in California.

Taking account of these struggles is important for at least two reasons. First, "bottom up" documentation of poor women's social movements during this period is sparse. Having such a resource is itself a valuable research contribution. Second, as Reese's subtitle to the book suggests, the work documents the ways in which progressive social movements have adapted strategies in a period of conservative ascendency. More important, however, is her depiction and analysis of how less powerful groups might effectively combat federal devolution. While conservatives have crafted a strategy of giving states more political authority and fiscal responsibilities, this creates time-honored spaces and avenues for effective pushback. Some of the most interesting lessons from the book include the unfolding of the ways in which local groups effectively link with statewide and national movements to craft messages specifically tailored to local conditions, institutions, and politics. Coalitions in California and Wisconsin, for example, planned specific messages while effectively organizing key local or state political leaders to rethink welfare policies. The story of how Wisconsin's Republican governor and welfare reform architect Tommy Thompson acted to avoid completely defunding immigrants provides a compelling example.

The coalitions developed and the strategies employed that Reese lays out in her book remain highly relevant in poor mothers' struggles today. But, the "hats" that poor and low-income moms are wearing have changed from welfare recipients to equally vulnerable low-wage workers. That the struggles over living wage ordinances; paid family leave and sick days; and union and legal representation of low-wage workers such as child care workers, home health aides, and janitors have been waged by the exact same players and in the wake of welfare reform is no coincidence. Conservatives, however, have recently figured this out as well and gone after these groups with a vengeance. Right-wing media and federal politicians effectively demonized and then destroyed ACORN, the key player in living wage fights. Republican state governors are working on doing the same to public sector workers and their unions such as AFSCME. At the same time, they are shredding state funding that goes to private sector entities that provide health care and social assistance to low-income families made up of low-wage workers, many of whom are now represented by SEIU and other unions. Reese's work takes on particular resonance as the retrenchment take-down trickles up.

Randy Albelda
Professor of Economics
University of Massachusetts Boston

Disintegrating Democracy at Work: Labor Unions and the Future of Good Jobs in the Service Economy. By Virginia Doellgast. Ithaca and London: ILR Press, an imprint of Cornell University Press, 2012. 248 pp. ISBN 978-0-8014-5047-1, $65.00 (Cloth); ISBN 978-0-8014-7799-7, $24.95 (Paperback).

The shift from manufacturing to services has brought forth questions regarding the implications and outcomes for the growing number of workers employed in marginal service sector jobs. Will competitive pressures arising from globalization and market liberalization lead to global convergence on low-road employment models, or can institutions and strategic actors continue to play a role in shaping management strategies and worker outcomes, even in these peripheral workplaces? These are questions that Virginia Doellgast seeks to answer in *Disintegrating Democracy at Work*. Through a compelling comparative analysis of work reorganization in U.S. and German call centers following the liberalization of telecommunications

markets, Doellgast shows that workplace democracy and encompassing collective bargaining institutions are central factors shaping job quality in service settings where managers encounter strong incentives to cut labor costs.

The book opens with an overview of the changes that have taken place in telecommunications markets and industrial relations in the United States and Germany. Here, Doellgast carefully details how industry deregulation has resulted in the fragmentation and decentralization of bargaining and the growth of nonunion competition in both countries. This sets the stage for understanding the competitive markets in which telecommunications firms operate and the strategies that worker representatives in each country pursue. Drawing on extensive qualitative field research in the United States and Germany, Doellgast then compares the "politics of restructuring" (p. 24) in telecommunications firms at the workplace and organizational levels. Matched pair case studies reveal that despite similar competitive pressures, telecommunications firms and their subcontractors in the United States and Germany implemented divergent employment systems. In general, U.S. firms provided workers with little control over working time and schedules, narrowly defined jobs with few opportunities to participate in decision-making, and implemented a performance management system that relied on intense monitoring, individual appraisal and incentives, and a clear focus on discipline. In contrast, German firms were much more likely to adopt a high-involvement employment model, characterized by greater worker control over schedules and breaks, more opportunities for employee participation, and a performance management system with group-based incentives, limits on individual monitoring and evaluation, and a focus on skill development rather than discipline. Doellgast attributes these differences to the collective bargaining institutions in each country. In Germany, unions and works councils used their strong participation rights to place limits on managerial control and were able to negotiate work redesign in ways that secured employee discretion and skills. In the United States, unions lacked the legal rights and bargaining power to prevent managers from adopting an employment model that centered on individual monitoring and harsh discipline.

These differences, however, were less evident at the organizational level where restructuring measures by telecommunications firms, such as outsourcing and subsidiary creation, have resulted in the convergence of management strategies and worker outcomes across countries (and increasingly, firms). Although worker representatives have been successful in slowing down and, in some cases, even reversing consolidation and outsourcing, employers in both countries were able to restructure their organizations in ways that weakened unions and existing conditions through coercive comparisons between in-house and outsourced locations and threats of further job loss. The analysis of organizational restructuring and its resulting implications for employees across workplaces is perhaps one of the greatest strengths of Doellgast's study. Through her case studies of U.S. and German firms, with additional evidence from France and Denmark, Doellgast effectively demonstrates that gains made by unions and works councils at the workplace level are not sustainable without institutional supports, such as sectoral agreements, at the interorganizational level. Such supports prevent employers from bypassing democratic arrangements and increasing inequality within and across firms via organizational restructuring.

Doellgast's well-constructed research design and use of supplementary international survey and case study data from the Global Call Center Project allow her to successfully show that national institutions can and do matter for worker outcomes in modern service workplaces. Two points, however, are worth noting. First, while the author's analysis of the politics of restructuring at the organizational (or "networked firm" [p. 122]) level is extremely valuable to her overall argument and conclusions, the focus of her analysis is limited to the differences in practices at the workplace level in in-house and outsourced or subsidiary operations. Little discussion is provided on the nature of the interfirm relationships between lead telecommunications firms and their subcontractors. Such a discussion would not only provide a more in-depth understanding of firm restructuring strategies but would also, and perhaps more importantly, provide a useful basis for developing potential labor and policy responses to such strategies. For example, how much control and involvement do lead firms have in their outsourced operations? Are these relationships simply arms-length market transactions or do these outsourced operations operate as de facto subsidiaries with high levels of lead firm control over management strategies and work organization? To the extent that the latter characterizes these interfirm relationships, there may be ways for unions and works councils to more effectively coordinate their actions across locations and to place pressure on lead firms to implement similar practices.

Second, Doellgast outlines the implications of her findings for unions and policymakers in the final chapter. Although her calls for institutional reform to expand unions' roles in management decision-making at the workplace level and for more encompassing bargaining at the industry level would certainly go a long way in improving outcomes for workers at the bottom of the labor market, these proposals seem utopian, at least in the U.S. context. As Doellgast herself notes, despite continuing calls for reforms to U.S. labor law, attempts to do so have consistently failed. Given the difficulty encountered by the Employee Free Choice Act and the recent attacks on public sector collective bargaining in the United States, it is hard to imagine that legal reforms to provide workers with a greater say over management decisions and to extend collective agreements will be implemented in the foreseeable future. Instead, it would have been more fruitful to provide deeper discussion of the ways in which unions and other worker representatives could achieve these goals outside the legislative realm. In this regard, the author briefly mentions unions' efforts to partner with community organizations and to create global coordinated campaigns across supply chains, but this discussion makes up a small part of an already small section on possible union and policy responses.

Despite these minor drawbacks, *Disintegrating Democracy at Work* is a mandatory read for anyone interested in understanding the relationship between national institutions, management strategies, and worker outcomes in the expanding service sector. High-involvement employment models can provide benefits to both employers and employees, even in peripheral workplaces where there are considerable pressures to reduce costs and rationalize work. Adoption of these models in such workplaces, however, and the resulting improvements to job quality and labor market inequality depend on industrial relations institutions and labor strategies more generally.

Tashlin Lakhani
PhD Candidate
ILR School
Cornell University

Phone Clones: Authenticity Work in the Transnational Service Economy. By Kiran Mirchandani. Ithaca and London: ILR Press, an imprint of Cornell University Press, 2012. 192 pp. ISBN 987-0-8014-7767-6, $23.95 (Paperback).

Indian call centers, which handle customer phone services for many U.S. companies, have become a curiosity for scholars and the public alike. They have appeared in films (*Slumdog Millionaire*), television shows (*Outsourced* on NBC, *30 Days* on Bravo, *Mumbai Calling* on BBC), and news programs (*Independent Lens* on PBS, *60 Minutes* on CBS), not to mention documentaries, plays, and fiction. Academic research on Indian call centers spans the fields of labor, management, economics, sociology, geography, development and international studies, gender and ethnic studies, linguistics, communication and media studies, art and photography, science and technology studies, health and medicine, and much more. Indeed, few types of labor have captured the attention of such a wide audience, across so many continents.

What strikes a chord are the many shocking and sometimes deeply personal developments in these workplaces: Why are *white-collar* jobs going overseas rather than the blue-collar factory jobs of previous eras? Can a person answer several hundred calls in a single shift and still sound pleasant? How can a country with such massive amounts of poverty, such as India, create office environments that are as lavish as those in Silicon Valley? Are these jobs oppressive or fun, privileged or exploitative? Why are Indian workers asked to adopt American behaviors for their work, and can they actually pull it off? *Phone Clones* delves into many of these compelling issues with artistry and skill.

Many U.S. and UK firms choose India as a destination for outsourcing because of its large, young, highly educated, English-speaking—and inexpensive—labor pool. With a workforce of 2.8 million, and contracts representing 50% (or more) of Fortune 500 firms, this industry has become a formidable presence in the global economy. Yet, by no means is it replacing the U.S. workforce: Indian call center employees make up a small fraction of those in the United States. Nonetheless, employment growth in the Indian industry is continuing to rise, while it