



Cornell University  
ILR School

Cornell University ILR School  
**DigitalCommons@ILR**

---

International Publications

Key Workplace Documents

---

2016

# Labor Market Rigidities and Macroeconomic Performance in the PRC

Asian Development Bank

Follow this and additional works at: <http://digitalcommons.ilr.cornell.edu/intl>

**Thank you for downloading an article from DigitalCommons@ILR.**

**Support this valuable resource today!**

---

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Key Workplace Documents at DigitalCommons@ILR. It has been accepted for inclusion in International Publications by an authorized administrator of DigitalCommons@ILR. For more information, please contact [hlmdigital@cornell.edu](mailto:hlmdigital@cornell.edu).

---

# Labor Market Rigidities and Macroeconomic Performance in the PRC

## Abstract

- It has often been assumed that there is a tradeoff between labor market flexibility and labor protection. Following the promulgation of the Labor Contract Law in 2008, employment protection in the People's Republic of China (PRC) changed from less restrictive than the OECD average to more restrictive than any OECD economies with respect to indicators for severance pay and dismissals. However this change and its impact are not well recognized.
- Overall, labor market flexibility consists of two components. On the demand side, labor market flexibility affects employers' decisions to hire workers. On the supply side, contrary to the common belief, improved workers' protection could in fact also improve labor market flexibility through the labor supply. This is also rarely discussed, but could help the PRC reduce labor market rigidity.
- Based on a review of international experiences and the labor market situation in the PRC, this policy note provides policy recommendations on increasing macroeconomic efficiency through improving labor market flexibility without necessarily sacrificing protection for workers. In addition to strengthening job creation, supply-side government policies, such as those to help workers moderate income fluctuations (both cyclical and structural) and improve workers mobility, could help restore labor market flexibility in the PRC.

## Keywords

China, labor market, flexibility, labor protection, severance pay, dismissal

## Comments

### Suggested Citation

Asian Development Bank. (2016). *Labor market rigidities and macroeconomic performance in the PRC* (ADB Observations and Suggestions Series No. 1). Mandaluyong City, Philippines: Author.

**Required Publisher's Statement** © Asian Development Bank. Available at ADB's [Open Access Repository](#) under a Creative Commons Attribution license ([CC BY 3.0 IGO](#)).

# LABOR MARKET RIGIDITIES AND MACROECONOMIC PERFORMANCE IN THE PRC

## 中国的劳动力市场僵化和宏观 经济表现

NO. 1

2016

OBSERVATIONS AND SUGGESTIONS  
观察与建议

© 2016 Asian Development Bank  
© 亚洲开发银行 2016

All rights reserved. Published in 2016.  
Printed in the People's Republic of China  
版权所有。2016 年出版。  
在中华人民共和国印刷。

The views expressed in this publication are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views and policies of the Asian Development Bank (ADB) or its Board of Governors or the governments they represent. Accounts presented here are anecdotal and do not represent comprehensive impacts of projects or programs.

ADB does not guarantee the accuracy of the data included in this publication and accepts no responsibility for any consequence of their use.

By making any designation of or reference to a particular territory or geographic area, or by using the term "country" in this publication, ADB does not intend to make any judgments as to the legal or other status of any territory or area.

ADB encourages printing or copying information exclusively for personal and noncommercial use with proper acknowledgment of ADB. Users are restricted from reselling, redistributing, or creating derivative works for commercial purposes without the express, written consent of ADB.

本出版物中所述为作者的观点，不一定代表亚洲开发银行（亚行）、亚行理事会或其代表的政府的观点和政策。在这里所阐述的事件是实际案例，不代表项目或规划的全面影响。

亚行不担保本出版物中所含数据的准确性，而且对使用这些数据所产生的后果不承担责任。

在此出版物中标明、参照某个版图或地理区域，或使用术语“国家”不代表亚行对任何地域实体的合法性或其它法律地位的任何判断。

亚行鼓励仅出于个人和非商业性目的对信息进行印刷或复制的行为，但须给予亚行适当的承认。未经申请并得到亚行书面同意，使用者严禁出于商业目的再出售、再发行、或创造衍生作品。

Note: In this publication, "\$" refers to US dollars.  
注：在本出版物中，“\$”表示美元。

#### **Disclaimer for Translated Documents 译文声明**

This document has been translated from English in order to reach a wider audience. While the Asian Development Bank (ADB) has made efforts to verify the accuracy of the translation, English is the working language of ADB and the English original of this document is the only authentic (that is, official and authoritative) text. Any citations must refer to the English original of this document.

为扩大读者范围，特将本报告由英文翻译为中文。亚行尽力确保翻译的准确性。但英语是亚行的官方语言，因此，本报告的英文原版为唯一具有权威性的（即正式的和经授权的）文本。任何对本报告内容的引用，必须以其英文原版内容为准。

#### Abstract

#### 摘要

- It has often been assumed that there is a tradeoff between labor market flexibility and labor protection. Following the promulgation of the Labor Contract Law in 2008, employment protection in the People's Republic of China (PRC) changed from less restrictive than the OECD average to more restrictive than any OECD economies with respect to indicators for severance pay and dismissals. However this change and its impact are not well recognized.

一般观点认为，劳动力市场灵活性和劳工保护两者间只能抉择其一。中华人民共和国（中国）的就业保护水平原本低于经济合作与发展组织（经合组织）平均水平。2008年《劳动合同法》颁布后，在有关员工遣散费和解雇的指标方面，变得比其他经合组织经济体更为严格。然而，这种变化及其影响尚未得到充分认识。

- Overall, labor market flexibility consists of two components. On the demand side, labor market flexibility affects employers' decisions to hire workers. On the supply side, contrary to the common belief, improved workers' protection could in fact also improve labor market flexibility through the labor supply. This is also rarely discussed, but could help the PRC reduce labor market rigidity.

劳动力市场的灵活性大体由两部分组成。在需求侧，劳动力市场灵活性影响雇主雇佣员工的决策。在供给侧，与一般观点相反，改善对劳动者的保护事实上可能增加劳动力供给，从而提高劳动力市场的灵活性。虽然很少论及，但这一点可以帮助中国降低劳动力市场的僵化程度。

- Based on a review of international experiences and the labor market situation in the PRC, this policy note provides policy recommendations on increasing macroeconomic efficiency through improving labor market flexibility without necessarily sacrificing protection for workers. In addition to strengthening job creation, supply-side government policies, such as those to help workers moderate income fluctuations (both cyclical and structural) and improve workers mobility, could help restore labor market flexibility in the PRC.

基于国际经验和中国的劳动力市场状况，本政策简报提出了在不影响劳动者保护的前提下改善劳动力市场灵活性的相关政策建议，从而提高宏观经济效率。除了增加就业机会，帮助劳动者缓解收入波动（周期性和结构性）、提高劳动者流动性等供给侧政策也有助于恢复中国劳动力市场的灵活性。

### I. INTRODUCTION

1. Labor market rigidity refers to the condition where firms and workers are unable to adjust flexibly to changes in macroeconomic conditions, and can slow down structural transformation. In general, labor market flexibility is reduced by various labor market institutions preventing the labor market from reaching equilibrium levels of employment and wages comparable to that of a market-based clearing equilibrium of labor demand and labor supply. These labor market institutions include those that directly affect workers' labor supply (such as social welfare benefits and unemployment insurance) and firms' labor demand (such as employment protection laws, labor standards, minimum wage standards, and wage bargaining policies).

2. There are many indicators measuring labor market rigidity. Today, by most measures, one of the most flexible labor markets in the world is that of the United States, while the most rigid labor markets are found in European countries such as France, Germany, Italy, and Spain. Historically, Anglo-American countries have chosen labor market institutions that tend towards more flexible labor markets, with low levels of employment protection, lower unemployment benefits, and low labor union coverage. Continental European countries have preferred labor market institutions that prioritize stability over flexibility, with more stringent employment protection measures, higher firing or hiring costs, and high rates of collective bargaining. Nevertheless, even in the countries with flexible labor market regimes, governments typically have in place robust, state-funded social protection programs in order to safeguard workers' wellbeing.

3. It has often been assumed that there is a tradeoff between labor market flexibility and labor protection. Yet, better protection for workers in terms of more secure employment and better wages can be reached not only through labor regulations alone. The same outcome can be achieved through a combination of complementary policies including active labor market programs, social security insurances, and collective representation.

4. Based on a review of international experiences and the context of PRC's reform and current labor market conditions, this policy note provides recommendations to improve labor market flexibility in the PRC without sacrificing protection of workers and employment creation. In particular, government policies to help workers moderate income fluctuations (both cyclical and structural), improve workers mobility, and increase job quality could help strengthen labor supply-side flexibility and restore labor market flexibility in the PRC.

## II. CURRENT CHALLENGES IN LABOR MARKET FLEXIBILITY IN THE PRC

5. In 2008, three labor-related laws came into effect in the PRC. The Labor Contract Law, the Labor Promotion Law, and the Law on Mediation and Arbitration of Labor Disputes became effective in 2008. The Labor Contract Law, which is the most comprehensive and important one, is the first major update of the PRC's Labor Law promulgated in 1994. It aimed to increase protection of employees through improved use of legally enforceable contracts and rules covering hiring and firing. By 2010, an estimated 71% of resident urban workers and 35% of migrant workers had contracts, up from 65% and 12% respectively in 2005. This has led to reduced informality and increasing number of workers covered by the five social insurances mandated by the law. The Labor Contract Law was further updated in 2013 to cover 37 million workers employed indirectly through employment agencies. Notwithstanding their success, these labor regulations had significant implications on the labor market rigidity of the PRC as explained below.

6. **The Labor Contract Law has turned the PRC's employment protection laws into one of the most stringent in the world.** Before the 2008 reforms, the PRC ranked much closer to the US and well below the OECD average for labor market rigidity.<sup>1</sup> In contrast, after the 2008 and 2013 revisions, the PRC is far more restrictive than the average OECD and non-OECD Latin American economies in all indicators for severance pay and dismissals, with the PRC scoring close to maximum restrictiveness. For instance, for a worker with a 5-year tenure, the mandated severance amount in the PRC is double that in Germany, and 5 times that in France. This is a drastic change from the earlier flexibility. Post-2008, legal burden of firing in the PRC rose above France, India, or Italy. Studies suggest this disproportionately impacts newcomers and less-skilled workers in the PRC.

7. **Rapid increases in minimum wages have increased labor costs significantly.** Especially in labor-intensive manufacturing sectors, double-digit growth in minimum wages compounded the increased rigidity in the labor market. Minimum wages rose an average 14% annually from 2009 to 2015 against an average annual labor productivity growth of 7%. By 2015, the lowest minimum wage ranged from CNY1,250 in Chongqing to a maximum of CNY2,030 in Shenzhen. Studies suggest that these minimum wages are well-enforced, with only 3% of migrants' wages below minimum thresholds in their respective locations. The ratios of minimum wages to average wages illustrate the increased labor costs to firms. In 2014, the minimum wage exceeded 60% of the average urban private wages in Henan and Jilin. In contrast, the corresponding ratio in the US was 29% for 2014. Very high ratios tend to reduce creation of entry-level jobs.

---

1. The OECD/IDB Employment Protection Indicator (EPI) is a composite of indicator covering 21 sub-indicators covering notification procedures, length of notice period for various tenures, severance pay at various tenures, aspects of unfair individual dismissals, aspects of collective dismissals, types of contract, and temporary work.

8. **Employment in the secondary sector has declined since 2012.** Elasticity of employment with respect to GDP growth has also declined in the PRC, similar to global trends. This elasticity measures the percentage change in employment with respect to a 1% change in real output. From 1996 to 2001, this elasticity averaged 13% for the PRC, and dipped below 5% after 2005. This means that every percentage point of GDP growth after 2005 has been accompanied by much slower expansion in employment. While the decline in manufacturing jobs comes with structural transformation, rising labor costs is an exacerbating factor.

9. **Social protection of workers remains low and still leans heavily on firms.** Although unemployment insurance coverage has improved tremendously in the PRC over the past decade, in 2015 only 22% of its workers are benefiting from this scheme. Coverage of occupational accident insurances is still also below 40% of the labor force, and did not cover 73% of migrant workers as of 2015. Similarly, although retirement pension coverage has reached 858 million participants in 2015, programs are fragmented and benefits are tied to residency, hence varying greatly.<sup>2</sup> Thus migrant workers who contributed in urban areas often could not enjoy the benefits after returning to their rural hometowns. Further, employers' mandated contribution to the five social protection insurances could sum up to an additional two fifths of total wages, with pension alone averaging 20% of total wages.

### III. LESSONS FROM INTERNATIONAL EXPERIENCE

10. **Labor reforms in Europe aimed to reduce labor market rigidity.** In the mid-90s, Denmark reduced structural unemployment through reducing rigidity by increasing flexibility of hiring and firing, improving active labor market policies, while strengthening income security through generous social welfare assistance. Germany undertook comprehensive labor reforms in 2003, including creating new job categories with less insurance and tax liabilities to support job creation, and coordinating unemployment benefits with welfare benefits. The International Monetary Fund estimated this increased Germany's long-run growth and reduced equilibrium unemployment by 1.5 percentage points. After the 2008 financial crisis, European economies with inflexible labor markets tried to increase full-time employment by reforming various labor legislations.

11. **High-income economies did not sacrifice workers protection.** This is important since flexible labor markets are typically characterized by larger fluctuations of employment and wages. In 2014 OECD economies spent 21.6% of GDP on social protection, including average 7.9% of GDP on

---

2. In 2015, 353.6 million workers participated in urban basic pension for staff and workers, while 504.7 million participated in basic pension insurance for urban and rural residents. However, the average monthly pension payments of the latter program was estimated to be lower than 10% than the former program, and could be as low as CNY70 per month.

retirement, 2.2% on incapacity (disability and occupational injuries), and 1% on unemployment. A 2013 ADB study found that spending on social protection in 35 Asia-Pacific economies averaged slightly less than 4% of GDP. Although the PRC has made notable progress in expanding social protection, especially in improving rural health insurance, social protection accounted for only 5% of GDP that year. This is better than the regional average, but far behind developed economies and the top 4 in Asia-Pacific: Japan (19.2%), Uzbekistan (10.2%), Mongolia (9.6%) and Republic of Korea (7.9%).

**12. Efforts to improve labor market flexibility balance support for enterprise growth and support for workers.** To achieve this goal, governments ensure that policies for increased workers support do not unduly increase the rigidity of labor market, especially for private sector firms, by increasing hiring and firing costs beyond what can be sustained in the markets. Support for workers should cover four broad areas: strengthening job creation, helping workers moderate income fluctuations (both cyclical and structural), improving labor mobility, and improving quality of jobs both in non-monetary and monetary terms.

**13. Meanwhile, strengthening social protection also improves supply-side flexibility.** Both Denmark and the US have no mandatory severance benefits. Instead, these countries have comprehensive unemployment insurance and more robust social protection to support workers who are laid off. In the US, state-funded unemployment insurance covers 90% of its labor force, providing 26 weeks of coverage.<sup>3</sup> Affordable Care Act aims to provide Americans universal access to health insurance, previously bundled with having a job. In addition, government rather than firms bears the main responsibility of retirement social security. Employer contribution to pension in OECD averages 14% of labor costs (and 0% in Chile, Denmark and New Zealand).

#### IV. POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS

**14. Reduce the overall burden to firms to encourage job creation.** Both mandated severance costs and employers' share of social insurances could be moderated. Instead, the government could improve labor market flexibility by helping workers reduce income fluctuations through better unemployment and health insurance. The ongoing tax reforms to rationalize business taxes are helpful to PRC firms. Tax cuts for businesses would be effective in job creation if they are targeted to support new jobs, such as offering specific tax credits for every new job created. The PRC central government

---

3. For states in the US with high unemployment, unemployment benefits can be prolonged up to an additional 20 weeks under the Extended Benefit program that is 50% paid for by the state and 50% paid for by the federal government. At the end of 2015, 2.2 million unemployed American workers were receiving an average weekly benefit of \$326 (approximately 45 hours of work at the federal hourly minimum wage of \$7.25).

has adequate fiscal space to improve coverage and benefits of unemployment insurance, which should reduce labor incidents following layoffs. The strengthening of the unemployment insurance should be coordinated with other types of welfare or pension benefits and portable across regions and provinces. This portability is particularly important to allow more flexible movement of labor across provinces.

**15. Calibrate increase of minimum wages to match local conditions.** Rising costs has already hastened the shrinking of secondary sector employment, which overall has the highest labor productivity. Under the 12th Five-Year Plan, the target for average annual minimum wage growth was at least 13%, higher than productivity growth and aggregate economic growth. To ensure that increases in wages are aligned with market equilibrium, the government could ease the pressure of increasing minimum wages annually, depending on local conditions. In the US, for instance, the federal minimum wage was last adjusted in 2009, i.e., there has not been any change in the minimum wage since then.

**16. Increase investments in innovation and the human capital of workers to improve productivity.** Estimates suggest that two-thirds of all jobs in the developing world are susceptible to automation, including up to half of jobs in the PRC. It is recommended that efforts focus on policies that support improvements in productivity of workers, rather than protecting lower-productivity jobs. The 13th Five-Year Plan's call for innovation-driven growth will require better-trained and higher-skilled workers. While ongoing efforts to expand secondary education and strengthen rural education are important steps, to reach the government target of increasing science and technology's contribution to economic growth to 60%, the government could improve efficiency of research and development spending and upgrade quality of secondary education, especially for technical and vocational education.

**17. Reduce migration costs, transaction costs, and information asymmetry in the labor market.** Key to improving workers mobility in the PRC is reforming the household registration system (hukou). In areas where workers are in short supply, workers mobility could be increased by improving migrant workers' access to public services. Strengthening the dissemination of labor statistics and regular labor force surveys would allow policy makers to better understand changes in the labor market, such as which workers are affected most by minimum wages and structural transformation. This would facilitate a well-functioning labor market, helping firms and workers find each other more efficiently, and for workers and students to choose the types of training that are actually in demand in the market.

**18. Strengthen job quality, worker retraining, and other supporting policies during the structural transition.** Enforcements of labor contracts could be improved by ensuring that wages and benefits are fully paid accordingly, and guaranteeing occupational safety of workers. Further reforms

are needed to give the 277 million migrant workers better access to public services and social safety programs. During the course of rapid structural transformation of the economy, there will be rapid changes in labor demand. Special funds, such as the CNY100 billion announced recently to be set aside for the 1.8 million workers to be laid off in the coal and steel sectors, should focus on retraining whenever possible, rather than simply resettlement.

**19. In the long run, these supply-side improvements in labor-supply flexibility and social protection would support inclusive growth in the PRC.** It is important to note that labor's share of total income in the PRC has fallen from over 50% in the 1990s to approximately 35% today, while capital's share of total income increased. This is part of a growing trend worldwide which is also correlated with increasing inequality. Although inequality in the PRC has slightly moderated since 2008 (as measured by the Gini coefficient) to 0.46, it is still higher than the OECD average of 0.32. Efforts to improve job market flexibility through strengthening aspects of social protection will make growth more inclusive and achieve better protection of workers.

### 一、引言

1. 劳动力市场僵化指的是企业和劳动者无法灵活适应宏观经济环境的变化,并能阻碍结构转型。一般来说,各种劳动市场机制和制度可能妨碍劳动力市场达到市场出清均衡的就业和工资均衡水平,从而降低了劳动力市场的灵活性。这些劳动力市场制度包括直接影响劳动者的劳动力供给(如社会福利和失业保险)的制度,以及影响企业劳动力需求(如就业保护法、劳工标准、最低工资标准和工资谈判策略)的制度。

2. 衡量劳动力市场的僵化有很多指标。目前,从大多数衡量指标来看,世界上灵活度最高的劳动力市场在美国,而僵化程度最高的则是在欧洲国家,如法国、德国、意大利和西班牙。从历史上看,英美国家选择的劳动力市场制度偏向更灵活的劳动力市场,其就业保护、失业救济金和工会覆盖率都处于较低的水平。欧洲大陆国家在选择劳动市场制度时,重视稳定性多过于灵活性,其就业保护措施更严格、解雇或雇用成本更高,集体工资谈判的力度更大。然而,即使在劳动力市场制度最灵活的国家,政府通常也会建立完善的、由国家资助的社会保障方案,以保障劳动者的福利。

3. 一般观点认为,劳动市场灵活性和劳动者保护两者间只能抉择其一。然而,要为劳动者提供更好的保障,使其获得更稳定的工作和更高的工资,不只通过劳动法规可以实现,通过将积极的劳动力市场计划、社会保障险和集体代表等辅助性政策结合起来,也能取得同样的成果。

4. 本政策简报回顾国际经验、中国改革的背景以及当前劳动力市场的状况,并在此基础上提出了相关建议,帮助中国在不牺牲劳动者保护和创造就业的前提下,改善劳动力市场的灵活性。具体来说,帮助劳动者缓解收入波动(包括周期性和结构性)、提高劳动者流动性、改善就业质量的政策有助于加强劳动力供给侧的弹性,恢复中国劳动力市场的灵活性。

### 二、当前中国劳动力市场灵活性所面临的问题

5. 2008年,中国颁布实施了《劳动合同法》、《就业促进法》和《劳动争议调解仲裁法》这三部劳动相关法律。《劳动合同法》是其中最全面、最重要的法律,是对1994年颁布的《劳动法》的首次重大修订。它旨在通过完善法律上可强制执行的合同和规则(涵盖雇用和解雇),加强对员工的保护。截至2010年,据估计有71%的城镇职工和35%的农民工签订了劳动合同,而在2005年,这一比例分别为65%和12%。这减少了雇主用工的随意性,且越来越多的职工开始被纳入五种社会保险(“五险”)的保障范围。2013年再次对《劳动合同法》进行了修订,覆盖了3,700万劳务派遣工。虽然这些劳动法规取得了成效,但同时也对中国劳动力市场的僵化产生了显著影响,下文会加以阐述。

6. **《劳动合同法》使中国的就业保护法成为世界上最严格的同类法律之一。**2008年改革之前,中国劳动力市场的僵化程度排名更接近美国,而远低于经合组织国家的平均水平。<sup>1</sup>然而,经过2008年和2013年两次修订后,在遣散费和解雇等所有指标方面,中国的就业保护限制远超经合组织和非经合组织的拉美国家的平均水平,其分值接近最高限制水平。例如,对于任职年限达到五年的员工,中国的强制遣散费金额是德国的两倍,法国的五倍,与之前的灵活性相比发生了巨大变化。2008年之后,中国雇主合法解雇员工的成本超过了法国、印度和意大利。研究表明,这对新进入市场的劳动者和非熟练工人的影响尤其严重。

7. **最低工资标准的快速提高大幅增加了劳动力成本。**尤其是在劳动密集型的制造业,最低工资的两位数增长加剧了劳动力市场的僵化。2009至2015年间,最低工资年均上涨14%,而年均劳动生产率增长仅为7%。截至2015年,重庆市的最低工资标准最低,为1,250元人民币,而最高的是深圳市,达到2,030元人民币。研究表明,最低工资标准执行情况良好,只有3%的农民工工资低于所在地区最低工资标准。最低工资与平均工资的比率说明企业劳动力成本上升。2014年,河南、吉林两省的最低工资超过了城市职工平均工资的60%。相比之下,2014年,美国的相应比率为29%。比率过高会使新增基础岗位越来越少。

8. **自2012年起,第二产业就业已开始下滑。**与国际趋势一样,中国相对于GDP增长的就业弹性也呈现下滑趋势。就业弹性能够衡量实际经济产量每变化一个百分点时所对应的就业百分比的变化。1996—2001年,中国就业弹性平均值为13%,2005年之后下降至5%以下。这意味着2005年之后,GDP每增长一个百分点所对应的就业增长率要低得多。随着结构转型,制造业的就业数量在下降,而劳动力成本上升更加剧了这一趋势。

9. **职工社会保障水平低,且仍主要由企业负担。**尽管在过去十年中,中国失业保险的覆盖率大幅提高,但是到2015年,只有22%的职工从该保障计划中获益。工伤保险的覆盖率仍低于40%的职工,且截至2015年,仍有73%的农民工没有工伤保险。同样,2015年,退休养老保险已覆盖8.58亿人,但是养老保险尚未实现全国联网和统筹,并且依然与居住地挂钩,因此各地养老金待遇差别较大。<sup>2</sup>因此,在城市缴纳养老保险的农民工返乡后往往无法享受养老金福利。此外,企业雇主需缴纳的“五险一金”高达工资总额的40%,其中,仅养老金一项平均就相当于工资总额的20%。

1. 经合组织/美洲开发银行就业保护指标(EPI)是一套综合指标,包括21个分指标,内容涵盖通知流程、各任职年限的通知期限长度、各任职年限的遣散费、不公平个别解雇、不公平集体解雇、合同类型和临时工作等。

2. 2015年,城镇职工基本养老保险参保人数达到3.536亿,而城乡居民基本养老保险的参保人数为5.047亿。然而,据估计,后者月均支付的养老金不足前者的10%,每月可能低至70元人民币。

### 三、国际经验教训

10. **欧洲劳动力市场改革旨在降低劳动力市场僵化程度。**90年代中期,丹麦一方面通过大规模的社会福利援助加强收入保障,另一方面增加雇用和解雇的灵活性、完善积极劳动力市场政策,以此降低劳动力市场的僵化程度,从而减少了结构性失业。德国在2003年进行了全面的劳动力市场改革,包括创造新的就业类别,通过减轻保险和税收负担来支持创造就业机会,以及协调失业救济金和社会福利。据国际货币基金组织估计,改革促进了德国的长期增长,将均衡失业率降低了1.5个百分点。2008年金融危机之后,劳动力市场灵活性较差的一些欧洲经济体开始尝试通过各种劳动立法改革,扩大全职就业。

11. **高收入经济体并未牺牲劳动者的保护。**这一点非常重要,因为灵活的劳动力市场内,就业和工资的波动相对会更大。2014年,经合组织经济体将GDP的21.6%用于社会保障,其中,平均有7.9%的GDP用于支付退休金,2.2%用于补偿工作能力的丧失(残疾和职业伤害),以及1%用于支付失业救济金。亚行2013年的一项研究发现,在35个亚太经济体中,社会保障支出平均略低于GDP的4%。尽管中国已经在扩大社会保障,特别是在改善农村医疗保险方面取得了显著成效,但社会保障支出仅占当年GDP的5%。虽然略高于地区平均水平,但远远落后于发达经济体以及亚太地区排名前四的国家:日本(19.2%)、乌兹别克斯坦(10.2%)、蒙古(9.6%)和韩国(7.9%)。

12. **改善劳动力市场灵活性必须平衡对企业增长的支持和劳动者保护的庇护。**为实现这一目标,政府应确保加强劳动者保护的政策不会过度增加雇用和解雇成本,使其超出市场的承受能力,从而导致劳动力市场(尤其是私营企业)的过度僵化。劳动者保护应当涵盖四大领域:创造更多就业岗位、帮助劳动者缓解(周期性和结构性)收入波动、增加劳动力的流动性,以及从货币和非货币两个层面改善就业质量。

13. **与此同时,加强社会保障也可提高劳动力供给的灵活性。**丹麦和美国均没有设立强制遣散费福利制度,而是实行综合失业保险,为失业者提供更强有力的社会保障。美国政府主导的失业保险覆盖了90%的劳动者,提供26周的失业救济金。<sup>3</sup>《平价医疗法案》旨在扩大全体美国医疗保险的普及性,而在此之前,只有有工作的美国人才能参加医疗保险。此外,承担职工退休养老金的应当是政府而非企业。在经合组织经济体中,雇主养老金支出部分平均占劳动力成本的14%(在智利、丹麦和新西兰为0%)。

3. 对于美国失业率较高的州,根据扩展福利计划(州政府和联邦政府分别支付50%),失业救济金领取时限可额外延长20周。2015年底,220万美国失业工人领取了平均每周326美元的失业救济金(按联邦最低时薪标准7.25美元计算,相当于工作45小时左右)。

#### 四、政策建议

14. **减轻企业总体负担，鼓励创造就业。**可适当下调法定的遣散费成本和雇主五险一金的缴纳比例。政府可以通过建立更完善的失业和医疗保险制度，帮助劳动者缓解收入波动，从而提高劳动力市场的灵活性。正在进行的营改增税制改革有利于中国企业的发展。为创造新就业机会而有针对性地为企业减税，例如为每个新增就业机会提供具体的税收减免措施) 将有效促进就业的创造。中国中央政府拥有足够的财政空间来提高失业保险的覆盖率及金额，这有助于减少裁员后的劳动纠纷。加强失业保险的同时，应协调其他类型的福利和养老金制度，并实现跨地区和省份自由转移。自由转移对于劳动力实现灵活的跨省流动至关重要。

15. **因地制宜，调整最低工资涨幅。**成本上升加速了第二产业就业的萎缩，而第二产业整体劳动生产率最高。根据“十二五”规划，年均最低工资增长目标在13%以上，高于生产率增长和总体经济增长。为了确保工资增长与市场均衡一致，政府可以因地制宜，下调年均最低工资增长目标。例如，美国上一次调整联邦最低工资标准是在2009年，此后，最低工资标准没有任何变化。

16. **加大创新与人力资本投资，提高生产率。**据估计，发展中国家三分之二的工作岗位易受自动化技术影响，而其中有一半在中国。建议研究提高劳动生产率的相关政策，而不是保护生产率低的岗位。实现“十三五”规划呼吁的创新驱动型增长需要受过良好培训的高技能工人。虽然正在实施的扩大中等职业教育与加强农村教育是重要的举措，但是，要实现科技进步对经济增长贡献率达到60%以上的目标，政府还可以通过提高研发支出效率，提升中等职业教育质量，尤其是技术和职业教育。

17. **降低劳动力市场的流动成本、交易成本和信息不对称。**在中国，提高劳动者流动性的关键在于改革户籍制度。在劳动者短缺的地区，可以通过让农民工享有更多公共服务来提升这种流动性。加强劳工统计数据 and 常规劳动力调查的信息发布，可以让决策者更了解劳动力市场的变化，如哪些劳动者受最低工资标准和结构转型的影响最大。这有利于形成健全的劳动力市场，帮助企业更有效地和劳动者进行需求匹配，也有助于劳动者和学生选择符合市场需求的培训类型。

18. **改善就业质量、员工再培训以及结构转型期间的其他配套政策。**通过确保全额支付工资和福利金、保证劳动者职业安全来改善劳动合同的履行情况。进一步实施改革措施，使2.77亿农民工更好地享受公共服务和社会保障项目。在经济结构快速转型的过程中，劳动力需求也会迅速发生变化。中国政府将于近期拿出1,000亿元专项资金安置钢铁煤炭行业180万名职工，其重点应尽可能放在再就业培训方面，而不仅是简单的安置。

19. **从长远来看，改善劳动力供给的灵活性和社会保障的完善将促进中国经济的包容性增长。**值得一提的是，劳动性收入在我国总收入中所占份额已从20世纪90年代的50%以上降至目前的约35%，而资本收入占总收入的比例则不断攀升。这是全世界范围内的一个重要趋势，与不平等加剧相

## Observations and Suggestions

### 观察与建议

---

关。虽然自2008年以来,中国的不平等现象略有缓和,基尼系数下降至0.46,但仍高于经合组织0.32的平均水平。通过加强社会保障,努力改善就业市场灵活性会让增长更具包容性,进而为劳动者提供更好的保护。



## **About the Asian Development Bank** **关于亚洲开发银行**

ADB's vision is an Asia and Pacific region free of poverty. Its mission is to help its developing member countries reduce poverty and improve the quality of life of their people. Despite the region's many successes, it remains home to the majority of the world's poor. ADB is committed to reducing poverty through inclusive economic growth, environmentally sustainable growth, and regional integration.

Based in Manila, ADB is owned by 67 members, including 48 from the region. Its main instruments for helping its developing member countries are policy dialogue, loans, equity investments, guarantees, grants, and technical assistance.

亚洲开发银行（亚行）的远景目标是实现没有贫困的亚洲和太平洋地区。亚行的工作旨在帮助其发展中成员体减少贫困，改善亚太地区人民的福祉。尽管亚太地区发展迅速，但全世界大部分贫困人口仍生活在该地区。亚行致力于通过包容性经济增长、环境可持续发展和区域一体化来帮助亚太地区减少贫困。

亚行总部设在菲律宾首都马尼拉，现有67个成员体，其中亚太地区成员48个。亚行主要通过政策对话、贷款、股本投资、担保、赠款以及技术援助等工具向成员体国家提供帮助。



### **亚洲开发银行**

Asian Development Bank  
6 ADB Avenue, Mandaluyong City  
1550 Metro Manila, Philippines (菲律宾马尼拉)  
[www.adb.org](http://www.adb.org)

### **亚洲开发银行驻中国代表处**

北京朝阳区建国门外大街1号  
国贸大厦（三期）17层  
邮编：100004  
[www.adb.org/prc](http://www.adb.org/prc)  
[cn.adb.org](http://cn.adb.org)