Cornell University
ILR School

ILRReview

Volume 61 | Number 3 Article 84

4-1-2008

The Mismatched Worker

Arne L. Kalleberg

Follow this and additional works at: http://digitalcommons.ilr.cornell.edu/ilrreview

The Mismatched Worker

Keywords
job matches

This book review is available in ILRReview: http://digitalcommons.ilr.cornell.edu/ilrreview/vol61/iss3/84

in 2006 announced a historic partnership with National Workers' Centers, offering certificates of affiliation.

The primary, but not exclusive, focus of the Workplace Project was wage and hour enforcement. Abuse was rampant, and state resources were grossly inadequate to deal with the magnitude of the problem. The legal strategies used by the Project included rights education, legal services, and lobbying. The legal needs of the undocumented were daunting, and the immigrant leadership had aspirations beyond providing services. Gordon describes the struggles within the organization to find the right balance between legal services and organizing, along with use of creative lawyering approaches that were a hybrid between the two. The rights education was used to support the organization's goals of collective action. The combination was potent, and undoubtedly contributed to the organization's success in its campaign to enhance minimum wage enforcement in New York.

Growing frustration with the limited relief available under wage and hour laws and the lack of enforcement served as an impetus to take collective action to another level. In 1996, the Workplace Project's immigrant base decided to work toward political change by developing a legislative campaign directed at addressing some of the inadequacies of wage and hour laws. The Project crafted legislation, the Unpaid Wages Prohibition Act, that increased the penalties levied against violators. Civil fines increased from 25% to a maximum of 200%, creating the strongest wage-enforcement legislation in the country. The book culminates in the details of how these Latino immigrants, virtually none of whom were able to vote in this country, mastered the political process and facilitated the passage of this statute. Project members not only worked extensively among the immigrant community, but also were instrumental in persuading the business community and Republican legislators that the initiative was worthy of support. They developed collaborative ties with two other workers' centers in the area and together managed to build the type of support that was necessary across the political spectrum. It was an impressive accomplishment considering the nature of party politics in the state and the social dynamics of this period.

Enforcement of wage and hour laws has improved substantially with the Unpaid Wages Prohibition Act. The DOL has used it as powerful leverage to settle cases. The law has also been an important tool for union organizers. The unions involved in the 2000 and 2001 green grocery campaign, which organized Mexican grocery store workers in New York City, found the Act to be an important component of their successful strategy, according to Gordon. This serves as an example of how broader community initiatives can advance union organizing, particularly of immigrant workers.

Gordon's book is an instructive read for those interested in the intersection of immigrant workers and union organizing, particularly non-traditional forms of organization. While much of her experience and that of her members would be familiar to those working with undocumented immigrants throughout the country, her real contribution is showing how a bottom-up, worker-run organizational structure can empower and mobilize the marginalized. Both the immigrant movement and the labor movement have been under siege; Gordon's uplifting account should be welcomed as showing us how working together more effectively can accomplish real gains. For labor organizers, her book offers concrete tips and eye-opening insight into how best to reach this constituency. A more condensed version would be particularly advantageous for the labor movement. With current estimates placing the number of undocumented in the United States at over 11 million, and Congress unable to adequately address the situation, immigration is clearly one of the top domestic policy issues facing the country today, making Gordon's book all the more timely.

Angela B. Cornell

Associate Clinical Professor
Director of Cornell Law School's
Labor Law Clinic
Extension Associate, School of
Industrial and Labor Relations
Labor and Employment Law Program

Human Resources, Management, and Personnel

The Mismatched Worker. By Arne L. Kalleberg. New York: W.W. Norton, 2007. 321 pp. ISBN 13-978-0-393-97643-4, $17.19 (paper).

Work, whether paid or not, takes up the majority of most people's lives; getting it right, then, has enormous consequences for the quality of life. A great many people, unfortunately, do not get it right. That is, they do not fit their jobs or their jobs do not fit them. In *The Mismatched Worker,* Arne Kalleberg draws on decades of his own and others' research to examine the causes and consequences of seven types of mismatch between

individuals and their jobs. The mismatches reflect a lack of fit between, on the one hand, individuals' preferences, interests, needs, skills, demographic characteristics, and market power, and, on the other, the required qualifications, physical and mental demands, stability, compensation, benefits, and locations of the jobs they do. In addition to identifying these mismatches, Kalleberg discusses the potential consequences of each and proposes policy remedies to address it. As he makes clear, the mismatches warrant remedies because they are more than personal troubles: in the trenchant terms of C. Wright Mills, they are public issues that affect not only individuals but also their families, employers, and the larger society.

Kalleberg develops a mismatch typology based on matching "types" of individuals (for example, single) with types of jobs. Mismatches occur when individuals' characteristics and preferences do not fit with the requirements of the jobs. The author begins with a general introduction, followed by a theoretical chapter. In the latter, he identifies the array of factors on which individuals differ (demographics, preferences, human capital, market power), the types of jobs available, and the labor market mechanisms that link people with jobs. Throughout the book, mismatches are described as resulting from structural changes in the organization of employment (globalization and deindustrialization, for example) as well as from individuals' changing work-related needs, expectations, and preferences. Comprising the rest of the book are seven chapters, one for each of the seven mismatches.

Chapters 3 and 4 are devoted to skills mismatches. Rather than take on the skills debate directly, a longstanding issue in the study of workplace transformation, Kalleberg approaches it obliquely through a discussion of the ways in which individuals can either be under- or over-qualified for jobs. In both instances, Kalleberg's explanation privileges the structural contributions to the skills mismatch without disregarding the role of individuals' education and skills. The chapter on under-qualification links this particular skills mismatch to structural unemployment and, here too, emphasizes the interplay of the supply (worker) and demand (labor market) factors that produce skill mismatch. Each chapter includes a brief discussion of policy responses to address the mismatch. In the case of under-qualification, for example, Kalleberg favors a combination of government policy and business policy to provide retraining, continuing education, or both.

Chapter 5 focuses on geographical or spatial mismatches—lack of fit between where individuals are and where jobs are. The causes of this mismatch are the well-known processes of deindustrialization, industrial restructuring, and off-shoring (one product of globalization). Referencing a broad range of literature, Kalleberg also discusses the connections among spatial mismatch, race, and the relocation of jobs from urban centers to suburban outposts that have been implicated in urban and racial poverty. Jobs traditionally located in inner-city, minority-dominated neighborhoods have relocated, often to inaccessible suburban locales. Hampered by lack of transportation and housing, as well as by entrenched segregation in the housing that does exist, inner-city employees are thus cut off from jobs they formerly held, deepening inner-city poverty and widening the racial divide.

The next two chapters identify two kinds of temporal mismatch, one associated with overwork (too many hours) and work intensification (too much work within the hours) and the other with underwork (too few hours). While Kalleberg devotes a later chapter (Chapter 9) to work-family mismatches, much of the story about overwork tends to be a story about the ways in which dual-earner families, now the norm, are unable to reconcile the competing demands of family work and paid work given the plethora of schedules, and employees' lack of control over them, in the 24/7 economy. As in the other chapters on forms of mismatch, in his discussion of overwork and work intensification Kalleberg examines how employee preferences and human capital interact with structural changes like internationalization, technological innovation, and demographic shifts. The other side of overwork is underwork, the subject of another chapter. The two major forms of underwork on which Kalleberg focuses are unemployment, an "extreme form of underwork," and involuntary part-time work. Again, globalization and structural changes in the economy figure largely in the explanation of underwork; another contributor in this case is union decline. Kalleberg identifies the ways in which public and business policy can address these mismatches.

A similar set of factors contributes to earnings mismatches, which Kalleberg takes up in the next chapter. The focus here is on the working poor and the squeeze on the middle class. As he has in previous chapters, Kalleberg identifies possible policy responses, weighs their relative merits, and provides a measured assessment of the most likely strategies for resolving the negative consequences of the mismatch. Alleviating the problem of the working poor requires increasing workers' skills, reducing the number of low-wage jobs, and revitalizing unions. The latter might be accomplished by raising the minimum wage and moving toward

a living wage. To address the middle-class wage squeeze requires recreating job ladders that allow and encourage upward mobility, investing in workers' skills, providing flexibility in work schedules and number of hours, and designing family-friendly programs.

The final mismatch Kalleberg considers is that between work roles and family roles. His basic argument is that jobs do not provide family members the time and flexibility of scheduling to fulfill the obligations of both roles. More than just temporal constraints, work-family mismatch is exacerbated by the interaction among several macro-economic and societal trends. Particularly important among these are increased female labor force participation, increased low-wage work (often disproportionately female), and the persistence in organizations of sex role expectations based on breadwinner-homemaker models of employment. These pressures are intensified by the dislocations industrial restructuring and global competitive pressures create for business and their employees. For policy suggestions, Kalleberg looks to Western European nations, where institutions to support a healthy work-family balance are more the norm.

Throughout the book, Kalleberg draws on illustrative real-world cases to underscore his arguments. Likewise, in each chapter he outlines basic measurement issues, sometimes pointing to difficulties in using extant data to measure a particular concept. He points to typical negative consequences for employees of each mismatch (stress, job switching, inefficiency, political disaffection, and so forth), as well as possible policy responses and comparative examples. We learn, for instance, that the United States would have to spend only roughly 1.0–1.5% of GNP, comparable to what France and Sweden spend, in order to implement family–friendly policies that would eliminate most work-family mismatches (p. 250). We also learn that a number of companies, such as the SAS Institute in Cary, North Carolina, have instituted a family-friendly 35-hour work week with no apparent harm to their bottom line. Rather than the more typical pie-in-the-sky policy discussions, Kalleberg answers skeptics with exciting and persuasive empirical examples of how successful businesses have responded to mismatches with forward-thinking, profitable solutions to these problems. One only wishes the book contained more quantitative information on how widespread (or otherwise) such solutions are.

There is much to recommend *The Mismatched Worker.* Certainly impressive is the wide range of material that Kalleberg has pulled together into a single, coherent, readable book. He has drawn on an enormous body of research, his own and others', across a variety of social science disciplines to produce a clear, accessible description of the mismatches that complicate work for so many people. Also impressive is the clear and forceful way the author links macro-level phenomena with micro-level consequences, which brings to mind Mills's insight that personal troubles are also, often, public issues. Such analyses are indeed so numerous in the book that they constitute one of its major organizing themes.

Stylistically, the essay form is hard to pull off. At its best, it is enlivened by rhetorical flourish and grace; at its worst, it can come across as overly ideological. *The Mismatched Worker* fits neither description. Its prose is workmanlike, its perspective pragmatic.

As for content, the broad scope of the material covered may weaken the value of the book for specialists. Instead, it would best serve those who want an introduction to this area of scholarship. Given the book's essay form that draws on and integrates considerable research that specialists would recognize, the specific citations are relatively limited, so it would not provide a comprehensive bibliography to the neophyte reader. Furthermore, as a trade-off for the author's choice not to present new research (but instead to summarize existing studies), I would have liked to see more pages devoted to the policy responses to mismatches and fewer to the descriptions of the problems.

These minor complaints notwithstanding, *The Mismatched Worker* is a clear, cohesive presentation of some of the most challenging problems characterizing work in today's economy. Even if it is ideally adapted to the needs of only a few, it can be of value to many.

Beth A. Rubin

Professor of Sociology
Professor of Organizational Science
Adjunct Professor of Management
University of North Carolina, Charlotte

From Hire to Liar: The Role of Deception in the Workplace. By David Shulman. Ithaca, N.Y.: ILR Press (an imprint of Cornell University Press), 2007. 232 pp. ISBN 978-0-8014-4473-9, $49.95 (cloth); 978-0-8014-7331-9, $18.95 (paper).

We have all known someone who feigns illness to skip work on a glorious sunny day. And many of us have found ourselves nodding in response