

Industrial & Labor Relations Review

Volume 60, Issue 4

2007

Article 84

Recruitment, Retention, and Retirement in Higher Education: Building and Managing the Faculty of the Future

Robert Clark*

Jennifer Ma[†]

*
,
†
,

any decision, no matter how well thought out, satisfactory to some and unpleasant or downright onerous to others. Western has given us a fine introduction to this problem and the costs that certain sectors of society bear as a result of our turning to incarceration to tame wayward elements of society.

Edward C. Kokkelenberg

Professor
Department of Economics,
Binghamton University (SUNY), and
School of Industrial and Labor Relations,
Cornell University

Human Resources, Management, and Personnel

Recruitment, Retention and Retirement in Higher Education: Building and Managing the Faculty of the Future. Edited by Robert Clark and Jennifer Ma. Cheltenham, U.K.: Edward Elgar, 2005. xiv, 293 pp. ISBN 1-84542 185 X, \$100 (cloth).

Higher education, given its current tenure system and the end of mandatory retirement, faces an unusual problem: an aging faculty population who are postponing retirement. A large portion of *Recruitment, Retention and Retirement in Higher Education* is devoted to analyzing policies that colleges and universities can pursue to encourage faculty members to relinquish tenure and to retire. In addition, the volume addresses several issues related to the recruitment and retention of faculty members. TIAA-CREF, the well-known financial and retirement services provider, sponsored the conference that led to this collection of fifteen essays written by academics, university administrators, and researchers.

Robert Clark highlights the importance of studying faculty retirement and faculty recruitment by demonstrating that today's instructional faculty are significantly older than the faculty employed a decade ago. He cites statistics provided by the National Center for Education Statistics to document that the percentage of faculty above the age of 55 increased from 25% to 31% between 1987 and 1997. This six percentage point increase was almost entirely offset by a reduction in the fraction of faculty below the age of 40. At the same time, there have been dramatic changes in the types of faculty employed at today's universities. According to the American Association of University Profes-

sors (2002), non-tenure-track faculty constitute almost 60% of total faculty.

The recent changes in the hiring practices of colleges and universities are the subject of two separate chapters in the volume. Ronald G. Ehrenberg and Liang Zhang provide an econometric analysis of the demand for tenured and tenure-track faculty versus non-tenure-track faculty. The authors find that the increased hiring of non-tenure-track faculty is due in part to reductions in the price associated with them. Jennifer Ma and Paula E. Stephan document an increase in the number of postdoctoral positions at today's universities and empirically investigate why individuals decide to accept such positions.

The analysis of the recruitment, retention, and retirement of faculty members in the book is based largely on case studies and a survey of faculty attitudes sponsored by TIAA-CREF. Molly Corbett Broad provides a case study of the challenges facing the University of North Carolina system (UNC) in recruiting and retaining talented faculty. She also provides a discussion of the current retirement policies in place at UNC. John L. Palmer, Michael A. Flusche, and Myra Johnson provide an analysis of recent policy changes at Syracuse University, including a change in health care benefits, a new family leave policy, and a phased retirement policy. Jerry Berberet, Betsy Brown, Carole Bland, Kelly Risbey, and Carroll-Ann Trotman analyze the results from a survey of faculty attitudes sponsored by TIAA-CREF. They find that the needs of faculty members vary by age. Younger faculty members are concerned with issues relating to tenure and their relationship with their colleagues; older faculty members, with the cost of health care and the transition from being a full-time faculty member to being a retiree.

The cost of health care is a challenge to today's universities, and many universities must decide whether to keep offering health benefits to retirees or to eliminate the health benefits altogether. Sylvester J. Schieber and John Rust separately address issues regarding retiree health benefits. Schieber documents the decline in the provision of retiree health benefits in other industries and discusses why the decline in the provision of retiree health benefits has been slower in higher education. Rust uses a life-cycle model of academic retirement to generate estimates of faculty members' response to changes in the provision of retiree benefits. He points out that colleges and universities that are considering removing their health insurance benefits for retirees must also consider the implications of this decision for when employees choose to retire.

Phased retirement programs and voluntary

early retirement programs are important tools that colleges and universities can use to encourage faculty members to relinquish tenure. Steven G. Allen argues that phased retirement programs could be beneficial both for institutions of higher education and for their faculty members. John Pencavel couples a clear general discussion of voluntary early retirement programs with an analysis of one particular such program, at the University of California. Ellen Switkes analyzes phased retirement at the University of California, and John Shoven provides information on the early retirement plans available at Stanford. David Leslie and Natasha Janson report the results of their survey of faculty members at twelve institutions and two state systems regarding the use of phased retirement.

The case studies explored in this book provide useful information for university administrators. Since the book must rely on case studies to evaluate these issues, the book by default highlights the need for data that are comparable across institutions. Michael Baer, Deborah Freund, David Shulenburger, and Richard Spies discuss the need for better data sources and the types of information the surveys should provide so as to help university administrators design policies that will help their institutions maintain a talented faculty. In addition, the authors discuss future research that would help universities make the best decisions regarding employment. In particular, the authors highlight the need to evaluate how different faculty types (tenure-track, non-tenure-track) affect research and teaching. Robert Clark and Madeleine d'Ambrosio summarize the volume in the final chapter and discuss the implications of the research provided in the volume for recruitment, retention, and retirement policies.

Although several chapters in this book should be of interest to a general audience, all the contributions focus on one industry, and much of the book is a presentation of stylized facts aimed at university and college administrators. For that group in particular the book should be of great value. It provides tools and insights for university and college administrators to use when evaluating changes in retirement policy, and it presents valuable information in the form of case studies concerning changes in retention policies and retirement policies.

Lisa M. Dickson

Assistant Professor
Economics Department
University of Maryland,
Baltimore County

History

Schools of Democracy: A Political History of the American Labor Movement. By Clayton Sinyai. Ithaca, N.Y.: ILR Press (an imprint of Cornell University Press), 2006. x, 292 pp. ISBN 0-8014-4455-5, \$55.00 (cloth); 0-8014-7299-7, \$22.50 (paper).

In this ambitious and provocative book, Clayton Sinyai seeks to recover and revitalize a venerable labor tradition: the belief that an informed and active working-class citizenry is integral to ensuring a vital democracy. In both the workplace and the political arenas, he argues, unions at their best have operated as “schools of democracy” that provide workers with a civic education and prepare them for effective participation in the deliberative processes essential to maintaining a democratic polity.

Drawing on the insights of Tocqueville, Jefferson, and Lincoln, Sinyai observes that true participatory democracy demands citizens capable of acting with self-discipline and independence and committed to the principles of group decision-making and majority rule. As America grew more industrial, corporate, and bureaucratic, the prototypes of the virtuous citizen—small farmers and skilled artisans—were reduced to the status of wage labor, and these developments threatened to undermine the personal and political skills necessary for effective civic participation by workers.

In advancing his argument that unions have acted as schools of democracy, Sinyai examines the political thought of important twentieth-century labor leaders and activists. In contrast to most labor historians, he finds the voluntarist philosophy of craft union leaders such as Samuel Gompers and William Green far more compelling than the industrial union approach favored by the Industrial Workers of the World (IWW) and later John L. Lewis. For Sinyai, workers represented by the American Federation of Labor (AFL) craft unions were the moral equivalent of the yeoman farmer or small proprietor whose sturdy independence provided the foundation for Jeffersonian democracy. With their occupational skill and ability to exercise job control, AFL craft unions were able to demonstrate workers’ capacity for self-government and follow Samuel Gompers’s advice to avoid entangling alliances with the state that could undercut labor’s political independence. A most telling example of craft unions’ power and virtue was the success of their members in thwarting corporate officials’ attempt, through “scientific management,” to gain control over the