

Industrial & Labor Relations Review

Volume 60, Issue 2

2007

Article 89

Nurses on the Move: Migration and the Global Health Care Economy

Mireille Kingma*

*

countries. The authors thus emphasize that U.S. researchers' habit of using the institutional features with which they are most familiar as the model when analyzing other countries may be problematic. The main lessons to be learned from the second region (Chapter 5) are about setting up new programs from scratch. Several of these countries had funding problems as the needs for benefits outstripped projections. The most interesting aspect of the Asian countries (Chapter 6) is the dearth of UC programs, and the small scope of the programs that are present in the high GDP countries. Finally, the authors investigate two issues of great importance in Latin America and the Caribbean—inflation and a lack of administrative oversight (Chapter 7). Regarding the first of these issues, I was surprised to learn that generally appropriate adjustments for inflation averted severe erosion of benefits in most countries. Thus, it is the latter problem that is more important; in particular, a significant share of unemployment benefits in these countries has gone to people who in fact are not unemployed.

Whereas Chapters 4–7 are organized around the specific problems most common to each region, Chapter 8 shifts attention to the important problem areas themselves. The authors choose UC coverage, continuing eligibility, and long-term unemployment as three key issues faced by all types of countries, while acknowledging that their discussion is based mainly in the OECD experience.

Recalling the four objectives the authors set for themselves at the start of the book, I feel that they meet each of these objectives to at least some extent. However, they are most successful with the middle two. My guess is that anyone picking up a book called *Unemployment Compensation Throughout the World: A Comparative Analysis* does not need much convincing that unemployment protection is important, but the detailed foray into macroeconomic statistics used as background for the argument may cause them to set the book back down. I would encourage them to persevere (or else just skip forward) to the authors' overview of unemployment compensation throughout the world. This overview is both accessible to the novice and interesting to those knowledgeable about the programs in only one or two countries. Personally, I was fascinated to read about the relatively small programs run by such "Asian Tiger" countries as Hong Kong, Korea, and Taiwan. Similarly, while the cost breakdown is essentially an accounting identity, I found it a very useful way to think about the different choices countries have made about benefit levels and program access.

One disappointment for me was the relatively

little space devoted to discussion of future prospects. Such discussion is limited to a few scattered hints, such as a mention of the increasing role of IT and a discussion of Chile's new use of individual accounts. A short summary section that looked forward would have been a nice addition. In the authors' defense, however, such an analysis was not among their clearly stated objectives.

Overall, I think this book is a valuable summary of the state of UC programs around the world at the start of the 21st century. It should be of value to anyone looking for a better understanding of the role of UC in the global economy. Thus, it should appeal not only to those with a long-standing interest in the UC system, but also to those coming fresh to the area of unemployment protection.

Patricia M. Anderson

Professor of Economics
Dartmouth College

Nurses on the Move: Migration and the Global Health Care Economy. By Mireille Kingma. Ithaca, N.Y.: ILR Press (an imprint of Cornell University Press), 2005. 275 pp. ISBN 0-8014-4305-9, \$49.95 (cloth); 0-8014-7259-8, \$24.95 (paper).

The U.S. healthcare system has experienced periodic nursing shortages over the past fifty years. The most recent shortage, however, which began in the late 1990s, is more severe than previous ones and promises to have longer-term repercussions. In addition, the current shortage extends beyond the United States, touching most developed and developing countries alike. One of the responses to the current nurse shortage, at least among affluent countries, is the recruitment of nurses from less affluent nations. *Nurses on the Move* is an exhaustively researched and well-written book that provides an in-depth look at the phenomenon of nurse recruitment and migration.

Muriel Kingma is a consultant on nursing and health policy for the International Council of Nurses (ICN), based in Geneva, Switzerland, a global organization that brings together nurses' associations from 129 countries to advocate for the nursing profession. She is also a registered nurse. Kingma's work with ICN provides her with access to nurses around the world, and she has used this access to gather a wealth of information on the complex phenomenon of nurse migration.

Kingma begins her book by noting that the term *nurse* has no standard international mean-

ing. The training, duties, and working conditions of the profession vary from country to country. Nonetheless, nurses worldwide have a great deal in common: they are essential care providers acting within a complex socioeconomic environment, and they all bring a unique set of aptitudes, skills, and professional practice expertise to their work.

Early in the book, the author focuses on the nuts and bolts of international nurse migration, including the factors motivating nurses to emigrate, the international employment agencies that recruit nurses, the barriers to migration nurses face, and the extent of the global nurse shortage. The detailed discussion of the reasons nurses migrate identifies such issues as the quality of life, remuneration to families at home, workplace violence in the source country, and salary and career advancement. In this section, Kingma also explores the meaning of terms such as brain drain, brain gain, brain circulation, and push and pull factors, all in reference to nurse migration.

Later in the book, the author weighs the impact of nurse migration on the home and host countries. She concludes that the migration of nurses from developing countries depletes a resource that is desperately needed in the already poor-to-marginal healthcare systems of these less affluent nations. She also concludes that the recruitment of foreign nurses only serves as a band-aid for affluent countries and distracts them from addressing the root causes of the nurse shortage. Pay and working conditions are at the heart of the nursing shortage worldwide, and the problem cannot be resolved until policy-makers in the United States and abroad deal with these two key issues.

Adding greatly to the empirical information the author provides are the firsthand accounts of nurses who have emigrated. Their stories provide insight into the sometimes complex and difficult decision to emigrate and leave one's friends, family, and culture behind for the uncertain promise of a better life elsewhere.

These personal stories from nurses also provide insight into the range of experiences of migrating nurses. Filipino nurses, for example, use a strategically planned nurse migration process that is facilitated by the Philippine government and has been operational for over fifty years. Many other nurses contract with recruitment agencies that range from helpful and responsible to exploitative and unscrupulous. In the course of this discussion, the author explores the uncertain process of transferring skills from one country to another. Because of the variations in nursing practice in developed and developing countries, significant retraining is often required of foreign nurses. In

particular, many nurses from poor countries are unfamiliar with the medical technology used in more affluent countries.

The personal stories also suggest that many, if not most, nurses are reluctant to leave their home countries. Even where the pull factors of the destination country are substantial, migration is much more likely to occur where there are substantial push factors driving nurses from the source country.

Kingma spends considerable time examining strategies for addressing the problems caused by nurse migration and recruitment. One strategy with significant potential in this regard is managed migration. Managed migration—allowing nurses who come home after a period abroad to return to positions commensurate with their qualifications and skill levels, for example—offers a way to facilitate temporary employment abroad and ensure reintegration in the source country's public service without loss of employment and seniority benefits. Most nurses would rather not emigrate to a foreign country and, if given the choice, would prefer to be circular (or temporary) rather than permanent migrants. The author underscores the point that it is not migration that needs to be curbed, but rather the need to migrate. Only then can the focus be on brain exchange and circulation rather than brain drain and the nurse shortage.

The book also includes a chapter on international trade and migration. Here, Kingma's discussion of tariffs and trade and foreign investment in hospitals veers a bit from the nursing focus found in the rest of the book. Overall, however, the book provides a thorough and balanced presentation of the many facets of nurse migration.

In the concluding chapter, aptly titled "The Grass *Could* Be Greener," the author considers a number of possible solutions to the migration problem and how these solutions might affect the future of nurse migration. She reiterates that brain circulation, a return of the migrant nurse to the original country, is the central issue for those interested in the future of nursing globally. If allowed to contribute newly acquired knowledge and skills upon their return, the migrant nurses will improve patient care services and represent a net gain to their nations' healthcare systems.

Kingma concludes by raising a number of questions and concerns about the future of the nursing profession in the face of significant nurse migration. She argues that one particular problem facing researchers is that the data on this problem are inaccurate, inconsistent, incomplete, or lacking altogether.

Beyond the obvious audience of nurses, nursing

administrators, and nurse scholars, this well-written book should also be of interest to labor and health economists, human resource managers in healthcare, and even consumers of healthcare. Nurse migration is now, and will continue to be, a significant challenge for the global health care system. As a practicing nurse educator, I thoroughly enjoyed both the writing style and content of this book, including Kingma's personal thoughts about this most challenging worldwide phenomenon.

Darlene Clark

RN, MS,
Senior Lecturer in Nursing
School of Nursing
The Pennsylvania State University

History

Death in the Haymarket: A Story of Chicago, the First Labor Movement, and the Bombing That Divided Gilded Age America. By James Green. New York: Pantheon, 2006. 383 pp. ISBN 0-375-42237-4, \$26.95 (cloth).

The subtitle of James Green's new history of the most famous pre-9/11 instance of a "terrorist" act in the United States, the Haymarket bombing of 1886 in Chicago, fully conveys the scope and content of his book. Green sets the bomb that exploded at the end of a protest meeting at Haymarket Square on May 4, 1886, firmly within the context of the growth of the city of Chicago. As he tells the story, Chicago not only was one of the fastest-growing cities in the post-Civil War United States and an exemplar of a second industrial revolution, but it also became the nation's most class-divided urban center. Small wonder, then, that in a rapidly growing city split between a mass of immigrant workers (German, Scandinavian, Irish, British, and Eastern European in origin) who were overworked, underpaid, and exploited, and an emergent entrepreneurial class that waxed ever more wealthy and lived in palatial mansions, there emerged the nation's largest, most militant, and most radical labor movement. It was a labor movement that encompassed craft unionists, utopian all-grades unionists of the Knights of Labor variety, socialists who preached orthodox Marxism, anarchists, and even exponents of liberation through violence. Such a mass labor movement exacerbated class divisions in the city. When the Haymarket protest meeting, itself a result of labor-conflict-induced violence, terminated in a bombing that precipitated an equally

violent police reaction, the action and reaction caused the deaths of seven police officers and at least four civilians, as well as wounds to perhaps forty-nine meeting attendees and passers-by. The city of Chicago and the entire nation, according to Green, split along the axis of class.

Green has written his history of death in the Haymarket to reach an audience of literate readers rather than scholars. Hence he organized his story into a series of sixteen short chapters plus an epilogue. And he has created a narrative rather than an analytical history, one that prefers vernacular English to scholarly language and avoids academic jargon like the plague, and in which annotation is buried in endnotes. If the reviews his book have already received in general audience publications are any indication of its appeal to the trade book market, Green may, indeed, win a relatively large reading public. And if the reviewers in such venues as the *Sunday New York Times Book Review*, the *New Yorker*, and the *Nation* are to be believed, Green's book will teach its readers what they most need to know about a dramatic and transformational event in the nation's past that has been lost to the memory of most common citizens. Such reviews, however, are more indicative of the gulf between common conceptions of the American past and scholarly recreations of that past than they are of what Green actually adds to our knowledge of Haymarket's impact on its time and ours. In fact, Green could not have written his book without the benefit of the scholarship of numerous mid- and late twentieth-century historians of Chicago, Haymarket, the labor movement, and anarchism, among whom the most prominent are Paul Avrich, Bruce Nelson, Bessie Pierce, Richard Schneirov, William Cronin, and Carl Smith (as the endnotes attest).

Perhaps the best way to comprehend what Green has accomplished or failed to achieve is to compare his history of Haymarket to that of Avrich, published 23 years ago (*The Haymarket Tragedy*, Princeton University Press, 1984). Avrich, to be sure, remains our preeminent scholar of anarchism, and Green has added little, if anything, to Avrich's analysis of the relationship among anarchism, labor in Chicago, class conflict, and Haymarket. Green's treatment of the Haymarket bombing proper—its immediate antecedents, the protest meeting, the bomb, the violent police response, the ensuing police dragnet, the "red scare," the biased trial of the eight anarchists, and the hanging of four of the convicted defendants—scarcely differs from Avrich's. The same might be said of Green's biographical portraits of the eight defendants, most notably Albert Parsons (his wife Lucy as well), August Spies, and their six