

Industrial & Labor Relations Review

Volume 58, Issue 4

2005

Article 92

The Other Women's Movement: Workplace Justice and Social Rights in Modern America

Dorothy Sue Cobble*

*

Copyright ©2005 by the authors. All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without the prior written permission of the publisher, bepress, which has been given certain exclusive rights by the author. *Industrial & Labor Relations Review* is produced by The Berkeley Electronic Press (bepress). <http://digitalcommons.ilr.cornell.edu/ilrreview>

interesting. Birgit Beese, Klaus Dörre, and Bernd Röttger discuss local union participation in economic development policy in three of Germany's distressed industrial regions, Chemnitz, Dortmund, and Nuremberg. Although unions find new roles and contribute to local policymaking, anti-unionism in the new workplaces prevent organizational gains. Maarten van Kleveren describes a project driven by Dutch local unions to promote high-road economic development of transport-related sectors ("indistribution"). Unlike Beese et al.'s German cases, the Dutch projects attract new members to local unions; national unions, however, have been unable to replicate these successes elsewhere. Both of these chapters show how difficult participation is for unions facing both organizational decline and the development challenges in their local communities.

Although this book contains rich cases, fascinating methods, and an unwavering advocacy of workplace democracy, North American readers will require much effort to absorb its lessons, for two reasons. First, the authors do not triangulate their findings with alternate methodologies, such as surveys or comparative analysis. Subjecting the book's major falsifiable conclusions to the "positivist gaze" might have made the findings more broadly accessible. Second, they could have examined the strategies and instrumental behavior of labor and management. If Silicon Valley, for example, provides lessons for successful innovation policies, how will Europe avoid the social costs of economic development seen in California, such as low wages and pollution? Explaining how these projects' participants pursued their own—at times conflicting—agendas might have given North American readers a more intuitive view of how European social partnership works. Compared to the book's important contribution, however, its flaws are minor.

Fricke and Totterdill's book is an exciting read for those interested in the changing roles of unions, the effect of social relations on economic performance, alternative normative approaches to social science, the challenges of building a Social Europe, and the prospects for improving the contribution of universities to their local communities. This well-edited book has interesting ideas and cases and reminds us that researchers should behave as if they live in the same world that they study.

Ian Greer

Ph.D. Candidate
School of Industrial and Labor Relations
Cornell University

Historical Studies

The Other Women's Movement: Workplace Justice and Social Rights in Modern America. By Dorothy Sue Cobble. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2004. 317 pp. ISBN 0-691-06993-X, \$29.95 (cloth).

Readers whose shelves have been filling up in the past decade with volumes on the history of second-wave feminism will have to make room for yet one more book. Dorothy Sue Cobble's important new work on the history of labor feminism offers a panoramic view of the many ways union women helped define the shape and character of feminism in the second half of the twentieth century. Although she draws on recent work on the subject, Cobble undertook considerable original research of her own. The result is a study of organized and unorganized wage-earning women and their allies, in industrial, service, and white-collar unions, that will interest labor historians, industrial relations and labor studies scholars, sociologists, and feminist scholars.

Cobble frames her study loosely around the careers and working lives of female activists. These mini-biographies allow her to be attentive to the changing union policies and public policy developments in the decades following World War Two; they also reveal the importance activists attached to racial and class identities, as well as the ways their workplaces and unions structured their outlook. These newly situated women, Cobble argues, mostly joined together in the 1940s and 1950s in support of social feminism, which was an offshoot of the progressive movement's larger program of legislative measures to defend working women by curbing the worst excesses of the industrial age. Social feminists opposed the Equal Rights Amendment and focused instead on addressing practical ways to assist women—an emphasis that Cobble calls practical feminism.

The Other Women's Movement is less an internal history of organized labor than a treatment of union women's central role in the emerging support for feminist-inspired legislation and equal employment opportunity policies. Unlike female unionists in Canada and western Europe, labor feminists in the United States encountered a labor movement still in sympathy with aspects of a voluntarist ideology and a liberal state resistant to significant social planning and lacking a bona fide labor party. Consequently, to back wage and family support

payments, childcare, and other policies serving the interests of women in the workplace, unionists—occupying the left wing of the Democratic party—worked tirelessly at the federal and state government levels, as well as within their unions. They dominated the loosely formed coalition of business, religious, civic, and union groups that gathered with the support of the U.S. Women's Bureau.

This book is strongest in its coverage of the early 1960s. It was during this peak of postwar liberalism, with a sympathetic Democratic administration in office and Esther Peterson, long-time union staff member, at the helm of the Women's Bureau, that union women achieved their most impressive results. Cobble credits union women with playing a crucial role—possibly the dominant role—in bringing about the Equal Pay Act of 1963, the formation of the President's Commission on the Status of Women, the expansion of the Fair Employment Standards Act to include low-paid and marginalized workers, and the enactment of a law providing for federal government support of daycare. Even while labor feminists held fast to their emphasis on formalized protections for women, the economic and social realities of postwar America were leading many working women to gravitate toward support for equality. This difficult transition can be seen in the proceedings of the unprecedented AFL-CIO's Industrial Unions Department-sponsored conference in 1961 on "The Problems of Working Women," as well as the 1963 *Report of the President's Commission on the Status of Women*. With the ban on sex discrimination brought about by Title VII of the Civil Rights Act of 1964, rank-and-file women flooded the newly created Equal Employment Opportunity Commission with formal complaints. By the late 1960s the courts, to stem this onslaught, had invalidated most protective measures.

Cobble argues that union women moved from support for formal protections toward support for equality in the 1960s and early 1970s, and then, after the mid-1970s, back toward advocating from a perspective of gender differences, with a focus on comparable worth and reproductive rights issues. In none of these periods, she points out, were these women's allegiances clear-cut: for example, even labor feminists who favored equality after 1960 maintained a healthy skepticism toward the masculine standard of equality proffered by middle-class feminists (p. 223). Some female unionists, like the Hotel Workers' Myra Wolfgang, budged little from the view that sweeping demands for equality were not in the best interest of working

women; others, notably activists and staff members with the United Automobile Workers, chafed at protectionism's constraints on their efforts to advance their economic status and their place in the labor movement generally. Cobble seems personally drawn to those who fell in the middle, between these two tendencies. These unionists were neither enthusiasts nor enemies of the new feminism (195). They grappled with the tensions between the goals and strategies of equality and difference, understanding that the ERA, which unions finally endorsed in the early 1970s, would not solve many problems affecting women.

Although full of insights and compelling in its analytical detail, Cobble's book seems unfinished at times, especially when dealing with the post-1965 period. Indeed, two-thirds of her book covers the fifteen years preceding the passage of the Civil Rights Act of 1964, giving the last part of *The Other Women's Movement* a slightly rushed quality. One aspect of the emergence of feminism that gets relatively little attention, for example, is the hostility of male unionists to demands for gender equality. The resistance was especially fierce at the local level, where rank-and-file women faced harassment and even violence when they filed EEOC discrimination complaints. Cobble acknowledges the occurrence of such events, but does not incorporate them thoroughly into her explanation of the rise of support for equality.

There is much to admire in this well-crafted study of labor feminism. Cobble is persuasive in making the case that these unionists were complex in their motivations, priorities, and strategies, and that their contributions are central to the story of second-wave feminism. Moreover, although they failed to address important aspects of gender relations such as the sexual division of labor at home, they were successful in forcing other feminists to address issues of importance to working-class women. Cobble predicts that female unionists will continue to be an important force in what she calls a new class politics for the twenty-first century (227).

Dennis Deslippe

Scholar-in-Residence
Department of History
Franklin & Marshall College

Working Women in Mexico City: Public Discourses and Material Conditions, 1879–1931.
By Susie Porter. Tucson: University of